

# The Mother Country: Tracing Intersections of Motherhood and the National Story in Recent Canadian Historiography

---

**Kim Anderson** is the author of *A Recognition of Being: Reconstructing Native Womanhood*, and co-edited, with Bonita Lawrence, *Strong Women Stories: Native Vision and Community Survival*, with whom she also co-edited a special topic issue of *Atlantis: A Women's Studies Journal* (29.2, Spring 2005), entitled *Indigenous Women: The State of Our Nations*, which is available for free download at [www.msvu.ca/atlantis](http://www.msvu.ca/atlantis).

---

## Abstract

This is an historiography involving books that address motherhood in Canada, with a focus on how these works demonstrate tensions related to gender, sexuality, class, race and ethnicity in the formation of the nation. The author traces her argument through approximately twenty-five books that have been written over the last thirty years.

## Résumé

Cet article est une historiographie de livres sur la maternité au Canada, qui se centre sur les façons dont ces ouvrages démontrent les tensions reliées au genre, à la sexualité, à la classe sociale, à la race, à l'ethnicité dans la façonnage de la nation. Cette auteure trace son argument par l'entremise d'approximativement vingt-cinq livres qui furent écrits au cours des trente dernières années.

---

In his controversial 1992 article entitled "Privatizing the Mind: The Sundering of Canadian History, the Sundering of Canada," prominent Canadian historian Michael Bliss wrote about "the loss of interest in studying the evolution of a national community," about the role of history in forming identity and destiny, and about the work of a previous generation of historians in encouraging "a national consciousness" (Bliss 1992, 6-7). J.L. Granatstein followed in 1998 with a book-length polemic in which he argued that the new generation of "progressive" educators and the social historians who influenced them had shifted away from valuable overarching political national narratives to emphasize what he characterized as "victimization and blame-seeking on the fringes" (Granatstein 1998, 76). Granatstein called for a re-introduction of history that would "restore the past to its proper place in our national cultural consciousness"(1998, 148).

The positions put forward by Bliss and Granatstein sparked vigorous debate.<sup>1</sup> Gail Cuthbert Brandt pointed to the need to redefine what is "political," stating, "nearly all significant social issues are inherently political since they involve questions of who may access and control the distribution of resources"(Brandt 1997, 143). Some historians argued that social history merely tells a different kind of national story. Stephen Maynard, for example, suggested that the history of sexuality is national history, and he proposed "an exploration of how sex, in different times or in divergent ways, impinged on the history of Canadian state formation" (Maynard 2001, 72, 76). Jeffrey Vacante wrote that some historians are drawn to the study of sexuality and other areas of social history precisely because they destabilize traditional narratives of nation-building (Vacante 2005, 32). Vacante referred to Franca Iacovetta's assertion that

"nation-building required more than protective tariffs, backroom political deals, and a transcontinental railway...It also involved moral campaigns aimed at encouraging middle-class, white Canadian women to procreate - or face 'race suicide' - and at 'uplifting' working-class immigrants deemed in some way inferior" (Iacovetta 2000).<sup>2</sup> Vacante also pointed out that work investigating the intersections between sexuality and nation has enhanced an understanding of how "both nation and sexuality are culturally constructed formations arising from particular historical circumstances" (Vacante 2005, 31).

This argument could be applied equally to an analysis of the intersection between motherhood and nation, as demonstrated in Canadian historiography. In the last thirty years, historians have documented that ideologies of motherhood have assumed a prominent place in the public domain during times of change or crisis. Industrialization and urbanization, and war and economic depression brought pressure to mothers and motherhood, and the way in which both motherhood and nation were defined and then connected during these times reflected the anxieties and aspirations of the bourgeois white men who dominated the public discourse.

Social histories have shown how science, medicine, health and social services, religion and the law were employed to regulate the role of mothers, while also documenting their resistance and agency. This work has shown how notions of identity and destiny, responsibility for the evolution of the nation, and issues related to a national consciousness all fell into the laps of mothers at various points and in various ways. Within these studies involving motherhood, it became apparent that class struggles, racism, patriarchy, and heterosexism have been central to the less than noble and heroic side of our national evolution. This paper will demonstrate how books that explore motherhood in Canadian historiography have shed new light on the "national story" by drawing attention to tensions related to gender, sexuality, class, race and ethnicity in the formation of nation.<sup>3</sup>

Historical investigations into motherhood first appeared in the study of

maternalist politics with *A Not Unreasonable Claim* (Kealey 1979). This collection of essays demonstrated how motherhood in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was linked to anxieties about industrialization and urbanization. Mothers occupied a central role in reform efforts, as they were charged with responsibilities to both preach and practise a moral order intended to counterbalance economic and social change. *A Not Unreasonable Claim* portrayed the limited nature of maternal feminist ideology in the period, however, as reformers achieved "only partial victories," and eventually found themselves displaced by bureaucrats, many of whom were men. With the exception of Deborah Gorham's article (Gorham 1979) on the more radical politics of Flora MacDonald Denison, the maternal feminists in this book came through as middle-class matrons committed to conservative ideologies of motherhood.

Since *A Not Unreasonable Claim* was published, there has been surprisingly little exploration of Canadian maternal feminism that might either support or contest this early work. European and American scholars produced a number of books in the early 1990s dedicated to the exploration of maternal feminism and social reform (Allen 1991; Bock and Thane 1991; Fildes *et al.* 1992; Koven and Michel 1993; Ladd-Taylor 1994). This work exposed more progressive aspects of maternal feminism that were not present in any substantial way in the Canadian work. Recent books on twentieth-century European history (Albanese 2006; Allen 2005; Sheck 2004) indicate that the intersection between motherhood, maternalism, national politics and nationalism is a subject worthy of ongoing study. Although maternal feminism has a presence in a number of books that will be discussed later in this paper, there is a need for more work devoted exclusively to the history and variety of maternal feminism(s) in Canadian history. This work would ideally include explorations of more radical and more recent maternalist politics.<sup>4</sup>

Canadian scholars who moved into the "private realms" of womanhood in the 1980s provided historical perspectives on motherhood that showed links between motherhood and the

evolution of the nation. Veronica Strong-Boag's *The New Day Recalled* investigated what had changed for the generation of English-Canadian women following the expansion of suffrage. Women had new opportunities to contribute as citizens, yet Strong-Boag concluded that women "remained committed to their sex's primary responsibility for the maintenance of family and home" (Strong-Boag 1988, 217), arguing that girls were conditioned for motherhood from an early age (1988, 13 & 145). In *Les femmes au tournant du siècle, 1880-1940*, Denise Lemieux and Lucie Mercier documented similar findings regarding French-Canadian women. The authors drew on autobiographical writings of Québécois women to create a portrait of daily life at the turn of the century and discovered that "Toute la vie de la femme mariée gravite autour de la maternité" (Lemieux and Mercier 1989, 209).

Both books employed a life cycle approach that denoted a linear progression towards motherhood which represented the climax in a woman's life narrative. This life cycle framework didn't allow for portrayals of deviance from the motherhood meta-narrative, or for portrayals of more radical types of civic engagement. In depicting large families and mothers who identified primarily with their reproductive function (1989, 177-180), *Les femmes au tournant du siècle* also ran the risk of reinforcing stereotypes of the prolific French Canadian mother, which Québécois scholars in the Clio Collective had refuted (Dumont *et al.* 1982, 192).

Mothers' contributions during the Great Depression were recognized by Denyse Baillargeon in *Ménagères au temps de la crise*. Baillargeon explored the significance of reproductive and domestic labour during this time by interviewing thirty women who were married at the beginning of the 1930s. In addition to documenting their domestic labour, this book offered a snapshot of childhood, courtship, marriage, and early experiences of maternity. The stories of these women demonstrated their agency in managing "la crise" and in navigating their lives through the repressive ideologies of motherhood at the time. For example, half the couples in Baillargeon's sample practised contraception

(Baillargeon 1991, 109), finding ways to work around church policy on birth control (105-106).

By providing glimpses of early twentieth-century daily motherhood, the work of Strong-Boag, Lemieux and Mercier, and Baillargeon documented both repression and agency, themes which would run throughout the historiography that followed. The experiences and stories of the women they studied also showed the evolution of a young nation plagued by fears and anxieties about the family in crisis; a theme that has recurred in the public discourse throughout Canadian history (Comacchio 1994, 279). In exploring the everyday, these books demonstrated that women had to work with and around powerful ideologies that prescribed a disempowered motherhood as their primary role, partly as a result of these fears.

Scholars in Québec were the first to explore ideologies of motherhood within their work on ideologies of French-Canadian womanhood. This interest may have grown out of a perceived need to respond to the image of the French-Canadian mother in Québec nationalism.<sup>5</sup> Mona-Josée Gagnon's monograph *Les femmes vues par le Québec des hommes* looked at the idealization "la femme au foyer" in periodicals such as *L'Action Nationale*, *Relations* and *Maintenant*, and pointed to the centrality of the "mythe de la mère" (Gagnon 1974, 145) in Québec nationalism that harkened back to a pre-industrial and rural era (1974, 17-21). She also traced the marginal shift of women into higher levels of education, and their participation in the public sector which began in 1960s. Whereas this secured more participation in public life for middle-class women, it nonetheless kept them committed to family first and then to work in "métiers féminins" such as education, health and social services (1974, 72). Although the book was limited in primary sources, it was ahead of its time in considering the institutionalization of motherhood and the role of motherhood in nationalist ideology.

Andrée Lévesque's *La norme et les deviantes* provided a fuller look at the discourses of sexuality and reproduction for Québécois women, as experienced in the interwar period

of economic insecurities and nationalist nostalgia (Lévesque 1989, 21-4). The strength of the book was that Lévesque documented not only the "normative" discourses and practices, but also how women deviated from the norms. Thus, after presenting the normative image of the essentialist French Canadian mother, a "figure of love and self-sacrifice" as promoted by priests, doctors and politicians (1989, 25), she showed how Québécois women also rejected motherhood through the use of contraception, abortion and infanticide (chapitre 5). In moving back and forth between discourses of reproduction and sexuality Lévesque's work demonstrated the need for more studies of ideologies of Québécois motherhood as a subject unto itself. It would be interesting, for example, to explore whether pro-natalism was significant in any of the stages of Québécois nationalism.

In 1990, Ruth Roach Pierson, Andrée Levesque and Katherine Arnup published their edited anthology, *Delivering Motherhood*, the first, and as of yet, only anthology directly concerned with historical ideologies of motherhood in Canada. Themes of control, resistance and agency ran through *Delivering Motherhood*, which included essays on the decline of midwifery and the medicalization of childbirth, the institutionalization of unwed mothers, practices of abortion and birth control, state-sponsored education for mothers, and maternalist politics. Agency was apparent in essays which demonstrated the gap between medical advice and fertility practice, and in the prevalence of abortion as a measure of birth control (Roach Pierson *et al.* 1990).

Cynthia Comacchio made more direct connections between the construction of nation and motherhood with *Nations Are Built of Babies* (1993). Although it was the first monograph focused on discourses of mothering in Canada, this book fit within a body of international work concerned with state and medical intervention in child-rearing practices (Apple 1987; Ladd-Taylor 1986) and with the place of mothers in the formation of welfare states (Bock and Thane 1991; Fildes *et al.* 1992; Koven and Michel 1993). Comacchio studied the evolution of "scientific motherhood" in Canada, an educational movement initiated

by early twentieth-century child and maternal welfare reformers, and eventually governed by professionals who gave advice to mothers on everything from health, to hygiene, to dress (Comacchio 1993, 60). Gender and class were central to Comacchio's analysis. She depicted working-class mothers as the target of middle-class reformers (1993, 5), and showed how the movement, initiated by volunteer women reformers, was eventually taken over by male doctors. This book showed how mothers were at the core of debates and prescriptive rhetoric regarding the "progress" and productivity of the nation.

Early twentieth-century "scientific" advice-giving to mothers was also the topic of Katherine Arnup's monograph, *Education for Motherhood*. Like Comacchio, Arnup studied the popular and professional child-rearing advice that was promoted by government, the medical profession and the media, and she examined the "war on infant mortality" through initiatives such as well-baby clinics, milk programs and classes for mothers. Arnup also concluded that the campaign to save mothers and children was misguided in focusing on education while ignoring the more relevant social determinants of maternal and child health (Arnup 1994, 31).

Historians working in the late 1980s and throughout the 1990s were keen on exploring how women's lives were regulated through institutional discourses, and Angus McLaren and Wendy Mitchinson brought attention to the role of health and medicine in regulating motherhood. McLaren's co-authored book, *The Bedroom and the State*, demonstrated how sexual and reproductive health moved from a private to a public concern during the twentieth century (McLaren and McLaren 1986, 139) and how reproduction debates, arising from neo-Malthusianism and eugenics as well as socialism and feminism were key in the struggle to define the Canadian people.

In 1990, McLaren further exposed the intersection between national interests and reproductive health with *Our Own Master Race*. In bringing to light the fact that eugenics had a history in Canada, his book offered a significant challenge to the myth that Canada has been

"spared the virulent racism and class consciousness" of the United States and Britain (McLaren 1990, 9). This work provided a much needed critical approach to national narratives about "Canadians developing sense of themselves as a people with a noble and heroic history"<sup>6</sup> by exposing the process undertaken to establish this "people." More attention to race would have been welcome, however. For example, the forced sterilization of Native American women which occurred well into the 1970s has been documented (Smith 2005), but this history has not yet been explored in Canada.<sup>7</sup> Such work would further expose the discrepancy between popular mythologies of a nation built on a cultural mosaic (Francis 1997, 80-83) and the racist practices that have been employed in the name of national identity and destiny.

Wendy Mitchinson's *The Nature of Their Bodies* demonstrated how fears around societal change, exacerbated by the nascent industrial economy, resulted in a nostalgic call to return to more "traditional" roles for women. Mitchinson argued that Victorian doctors promoted the ideology that women's sole purpose was to reproduce (Mitchinson 1991, 61-62) and that many doctors "wanted to return to a time when they believed women concentrated their activities on having and raising children (1991, 71). Mitchinson's work *Giving Birth in Canada, 1900-1950* (2002) is also noteworthy as a comprehensive study of the history of childbirth in Canada.

The place of gender and motherhood in the formation of the welfare state has been the subject of several recent books. This is important "national story" kind of work, as the social welfare system is a prized Canadian value and is key to national identity. Investigations into how poor and racialized mothers were positioned within its development have exposed the underbelly of this source of national pride. Most notable is Margaret Little's study of the evolution of the Ontario Mother's Allowance (OMA), *No Car, No Radio, No Liquor Permit*. In addition to filling a significant gap in the historiography by paying attention to the experiences of single mothers, Little challenged deeply entrenched narratives of benevolence that Canadians like to ascribe to themselves as

a people. She argued that, in spite of providing relief from poverty for some mothers, the Ontario Mothers' Allowance also enforced a "Protestant Euro-Canadian middle-class model" of proper motherhood that reinforced the male breadwinner ideal (Little 1998, xv).

Nancy Christie tracked the decline of maternalism in the evolution of the welfare state from 1900-1945 in *Engendering the State*. She argued that there was an ideological shift during the Great Depression from what she saw as the "spiritual and maternalist" foundation of the "old reform" movement to a secularized approach that centered on the male breadwinner model and men's employment (Christie 2000, 14). She concluded that "welfare entitlements were directly determined by changing ideas of what constituted national interest" (2000, 310). National interests had moved from the social citizenship advocated by old reformers, to economic efficiency and full employment for men (310). Christie disagreed with Little's "moral regulation" argument about the imposition of middle-class standards of motherhood through welfare, but added to the understanding of the welfare state as deeply patriarchal.

Post-structuralism provided historians of the late 1990s with new tools to analyse the various discourses that shaped women's lives, and historians applied these tools to their study of postwar reconstruction. Mary Louise Adams provided a new lens on the traditional family model by demonstrating how family and gender were shaped through the social construction of heterosexuality. In *The Trouble with Normal*, Adams argued that the 1950s push for the nuclear, patriarchal family came out of postwar anxiety and the need for stability, democracy and protection during the cold war (Adams 1997, 21-23). She focused on the pressures on youth to conform to heterosexuality which culminated in marrying and establishing a family as a sign of maturity and adulthood, and ultimately, citizenship (1997, 23).

Mona Gleason looked at the role of psychologist in constructing the "normal" family in *Normalizing the Ideal*. Taking up where Comacchio left off, Gleason demonstrated how psychologists became the new (postwar) bevy of experts to prescribe the ideal family. She

documented how the mother was constructed as "simultaneously the most important parent and the most dangerous parent," which made it necessary for them to "surrender their autonomy to the expertise of psychologists" (Gleason 1999, 64). Gleason made the point that the expertise provided by psychologists "entrenched and reproduced the dominance of Anglo/Celtic (as opposed to 'ethnic'), middle-class, heterosexual, and patriarchal values" (1999, 4), yet more examples of how this worked are wanting, as there are only fleeting discussions of immigrants (92-93) and Aboriginal people (113).

Valerie J. Korinek demonstrated that women were not beholden to prescribed postwar roles of domesticity and motherhood in *Roughing it in the Suburbs*. Through her analysis of advertising, editorials, articles and letters to *Chatelaine*, Korinek concluded that women readers "continually debated both the joys and the challenges of marriage and motherhood" (Korinek 2000, 7). According to Korinek, the magazine "encouraged Canadian women to think about other options for their lives" (2000, 26). Korinek discovered articles on abortion and birth control (2000, 283-4; 336-7) and other controversial topics including divorce, battered children, incest, drug abuse, interracial marriage, lesbianism, sexuality and poverty" (309), which subverted the ideal of the suburban mother. She uncovered the "covert codes" of advertising in the 1950s, which promoted the professionalization of motherhood and maternal devotion (2000, 127), but noted that maternal images, themes and issues were not as numerous as she had expected (382). In showing the feminist direction of the magazine, Korinek provided a more nuanced look at the difference between prescribed behaviours and the debates that were ongoing among women in the period.

It is unfortunate that the final section of this paper involves lumping all history about "immigrant"<sup>8</sup> and Aboriginal mothers in one section, but perhaps this "add-on" approach is symbolic of the position of "other" mothers in Canadian historiography. That being said, a number of questions and common themes arise from the small body of work containing information about "other" motherhood.

Much of the history of immigrants has explored the impact of migration and change, and it is interesting to consider how this change might have affected mothers and mothering in the new country. What kinds of responsibilities and experiences did mothers carry in terms of assimilation into Canadian society? Turning to questions of ideology, one might also ask how ethnic nationalism involved mothers and discourses of motherhood. Varpu Lindström's *Defiant Sisters* looked at immigration patterns, health, marriage, fertility, work and social organization among Finnish women who immigrated to Canada between 1890 and 1930. Her chapter on marriage and birth demonstrated the distinct practices of this population. Small families were the norm for Finns, particularly for those who belonged to socialist organizations (Lindström 1992, 79) where common-law marriages were also commonplace (1992, 71-75). Lindström pointed out that Finnish women had more access to birth control and abortion. This slim book presented much needed insights on women's experiences of mothering outside of Québécois or Anglo-Canadian Culture.

In *Wedded to the Cause* Frances Swyripa was more concerned with discourses involving Ukrainian women immigrants than with documenting their daily lives and contributions (Swyripa 1993, ix). Swyripa showed how women became caught up in ideals of Ukrainian Canadian nationalism, where "The home, as the primary bastion of Ukrainianness, exalted the significance of the private sphere, making mothering and homemaking women's major function" (1993, viii). Swyripa contrasted this with the pro-communist progressive minority, who placed less emphasis on gender roles or mothering and more on class struggle (1993, 155-156). Nationalists promoted idealized motherhood through upholding role models such as the pious Mary, Mother of God, who represented "a model of sacrifice and service for Ukrainian mothers" (1993, 133). Ukrainian mothers were constructed as "mothers of the nation" deemed responsible for raising their children as conscious Ukrainian patriots (1993, 134-136). Swyripa pointed out that "As the distinction among Ukrainian mothers, mothers of Ukraine and Mother Ukraine (*Ukraina* itself is

feminine) became blurred, their common motherhood established a special and inescapable bond between Ukrainian women and their nation" (1993, 137). Women's organizations also promoted models of the "good Ukrainian mother" who raised her children steeped in cultural awareness (157-58; 233). Ultimately, this "restricted their options and freedom of movement to what advanced the nationalist cause" (59).

As in the case of immigrant peoples, there is very little that represents the distinct experiences of Aboriginal mothers in Canadian historiography. Sylvia Van Kirk's *Many Tender Ties* and Jennifer Brown's *Strangers in Blood*, both published in the 1980s were the first to introduce Aboriginal women and families into fur trade and economic history. Their work demonstrated the influence of Aboriginal women (and mothers) in the early development of the nation, and thirty years after publication continue to be cited as core texts. More recent literature about residential schools<sup>9</sup> and the child welfare system (Fournier and Crey 1997) has shed light on the prerogative to erase "the Indian problem" from the developing nation, and about the impact of these policies on Aboriginal families. Some scholars have written about ideologies of white motherhood as promoted by missionaries (Rutherford 2002), and about how Aboriginal wives and mothers were constructed as inadequate in order to uphold white ideals of family and society (Carter 1997; Perry 2000). A recent addition to the literature was the interdisciplinary anthology, *Until Our Hearts are on the Ground* (Corbiere Lavell and Lavell-Harvard 2006), which contained some historical information on Iroquois and Anishnaabe mothering, as well as resistance to state policies of interference. All of this work has demonstrated what Aboriginal mothers had to suffer and resist in the development of the colonial nation.

As this brief section on "others" has shown, the historiography of mothering and ideologies of motherhood in Canada has ultimately been concerned with women from the dominant Anglo and French-Canadian cultures. Cynthia Comacchio's 1999 survey, *The Infinite Bonds of Family* was also a good demonstration of this gap. The links between

motherhood and nation-building discourses in the interwar period were clear, as she pointed to "connections between motherhood and a widely defined national 'health' were repeated, circulated, and politicized across the land" (Comacchio 1999, 91). Yet the introduction of Aboriginal or immigrant experiences into this text was often jarring, characterized by that "add-on" feeling and, at times, a sense that the material was too sweeping because it placed Aboriginal peoples or immigrants into monolithic categories.

The gaps in Comacchio's survey text were perhaps indicative of the impossibility of incorporating diverse experiences and ideologies of family into a single Canadian story. This brings us back to the dilemma posed by Granatstein and Bliss regarding the need to find a common history to address our "withering sense of community" (Bliss 1992, 5-6). It may be that the identities of people in Canada are too limited and too diverse to allow for a common narrative. But whereas it may be difficult to integrate distinct mothering experiences and ideologies (such as those represented by Aboriginal peoples) into a national story, it has been possible to write about dominant ideologies of motherhood. History about dominant ideologies, practices and strategies of resistance grounded in motherhood are, moreover, significant to our evolving national consciousness, as they teach volumes about the oppressive and exclusionary elements of nation-building in our past.

"Why should any nations' text stress the 'black marks'?" Granatstein asked (1998, 94), after complaining that contemporary education is fixated on "remediating social ills such as sexism and racism" (1998, 33). The answer to this is found in the introductory section of *Who Killed Canadian History*, where Granatstein himself stated "Without history, we as a nation can not undertake any rational inquiry into the political, social or moral issues of our society" (1998, 21-22). To move forward into the future, we need to examine how sexism and racism, patriarchy, heterosexism and class struggles have been significant in discourses and struggles around building "a people" and a nation called Canada. The literature examined in this paper has demonstrated that mothers

were continually shut out of participation in public life through ideologies that confined them to the home. It has also taught that women twisted these roles and ideologies out of necessity or desire to find their way into politics and the economy. We can see how, in times of crisis, insecurity or need, public discourse has turned to ideologies of motherhood to lay blame or to seek solace. Mothers have been used as symbols of the nation's shortcomings, progress and potential, and have been deemed responsible for all three at various times.

The promotion of a white, middle-class and heterosexual motherhood at various points in our history was a significant indicator about the kind of nation those in prominent positions were hoping for. The fact that it has not entirely come to pass is an indication of how much we need to look to this history in our deliberations about the future. At the risk of sounding whiggish or unrealistically optimistic, we are now facing a society where women have reproductive choices, where Aboriginal families are in recovery, where same sex marriage and lesbian motherhood are possible, and in which the male breadwinner is no longer a desire or an option for many middle-class families. We can take a lesson from this social history that questions of race, class, gender and sexuality in family matters are likely to come under scrutiny again as we proceed through times of crisis, insecurity or instability.

To move forward, we need history that can tell us about alternatives to dominant ideologies of motherhood, as well as histories that can inspire us to explore different kinds of economies and politics.<sup>10</sup> Granatstein ended *Who Killed Canadian History?* with the assertion that "We have a past of selfless service to freedom and democracy; we are all but free of atrocities; and our national sins, weighed in the global balance, are minor" (1998, 147). If it is at all possible to foster something resembling a healthy nationalism, it will only come through challenging these assertions. Perhaps Canadians find a national sense of pride in this "selfless service to freedom and democracy," but this is not based on the lived experiences of many of our citizens. In exposing the less free, less democratic, and more atrocious elements of

motherhood, social historians have a role to play in inspiring healthy and inclusive national identities that can counter nation-building narratives based on oppression and exclusion.

#### Endnotes

1. For early response to the Bliss article, see Gregory S. Kealey, "Class in English-Canadian Historical Writing: Neither Privatizing, Nor Sundering"; Linda Kealey, Ruth Pierson, Joan Sangster and Veronica Strong-Boag, "Teaching Canadian History in the 1990s: Whose 'National' History are We Lamenting?"; and R.B. Fleming, "The Unbearable Lightness of Being Canadian," all published in *Journal of Canadian Studies/Revue d'études canadiennes*, 27 (Été 1992 Summer): pp. 123-35. Replies to Granatstein included A.B. McKillop, "Who Killed Canadian History? A View from the Trenches," *Canadian Historical Review* 80.2, (1999): 269-99; Bryan D. Palmer, "Of Silences and Trenches: A Dissident View of Granatstein's Meaning," *Canadian Historical Review*, 80.4, (December 1999): 676-86; and Timothy J. Stanley, "Why I Killed Canadian History: Conditions for an Anti-Racist History in Canada," *Histoire sociale/Social History*, 33.65 (2000): 79-103.
2. See Franca Iacovetta, "The Sexual Politics of Moral Citizenship and Containing 'Dangerous' Foreign Men in Cold War Canada, 1950s - 1960s," *Histoire sociale/Social History* 33.6 (2000): 366.
3. In this paper I do not address the many positive elements of motherhood in the past. The intent of this piece is to focus on how these books demonstrated the oppressive elements of motherhood as they intersected with Canadian nationalism.
4. Cheryl Gosselin has produced an article on post-war maternalist politics in Québec. See "Maternal Commitments to the Nation: Maternalist Groups at Work in Québec: 1945-1960," *Journal of the Association for Research on Mothering* 8.1,2 (2006): 282-97.
5. Susan Mann has explored the position of women in early French Canadian nationalism in two articles. See "Henri Bourassa and the Woman Question," in Susan Mann Trofimenkoff and Alison Prentice, eds. *The Neglected Majority: Essays in Canadian*



*Women's History*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1977, pp. 104-15; and "Les femmes dans l'oeuvre de Groulx," *Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française*, 32.3 (décembre 1978): 385-98.

6. Here, I quote from Bliss, p. 7.

7. There is plenty of anecdotal evidence through oral history - stories that I am personally aware of - but the forced sterilization of Native women in Canada has yet to be documented.

8. I put immigrant in quotation marks here because, with the exception of Aboriginal Canadians, everyone in Canada is an immigrant, yet Anglo-Canadians and French Canadians are never labeled this way. That is to say, only people of colour, or those who do not speak (European) French or English as a first language get classified as "immigrant."

9. See Scott Trevithick, "Native Residential Schooling in Canada: A Review of the Literature," *Canadian Journal of Native Studies* 18.1 (1998): 5-52.

10. Lisa D. Brush has reviewed international studies on motherhood to explore the potential for maternalist politics in present day. See "Love, Toil and Trouble: Motherhood and Feminist Politics," *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 21.2 (1996): 429-54.

## References

Adams, M. *The Trouble with Normal: Postwar Youth and the Making of Heterosexuality*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997.

Albanese, P. *Mothers of the Nation: Women, Families, and Nationalism in Twentieth-Century Europe*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006.

Allen, A. *Feminism and Motherhood in Germany, 1800-1914*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1991.

\_\_\_\_\_. *Feminism and Motherhood in Western Europe, 1890-1970*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2005.

Apple, R. *Mothers and Medicine: A Social History of Infant Feeding, 1890-1950*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987.

Arnup, K. *Education for Motherhood: Advice for Mothers in Twentieth-Century Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994.

Baillargeon, D. *Ménagères au Temps de la Crise*. Montreal: Éditions du Remue-ménage, 1991.

Bliss, M. "Privatizing the Mind: The Sundering of Canadian History, the Sundering of Canada." *Journal of Canadian Studies* 26 (Winter 1991-92): 5-17.

Bock, G. and P. Thane, eds. *Maternity and Gender Policies: Women and the Rise of the European Welfare States, 1880s-1950s*. London: Routledge, 1991.

Brown, J. *Strangers in Blood: Fur Trade Company Families in Indian Country*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1980.

Brush, L. "Love, Toil and Trouble: Motherhood and Feminist Politics," *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 21.2 (1996): 429-54.

Carter, S. *Capturing Women: The Manipulation of Cultural Imagery in Canada's Prairie West*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's Press, 1997.

Christie, N. *Engendering the State: Family, Work and Welfare in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000.

Comacchio, C. *Nations are Built of Babies: Saving Ontario's Mothers and Children, 1900-1940*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1993.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Beneath the 'Sentimental Veil': Families and Family History in Canada." *Labour/Le Travail* 33 (Spring 1994): 279-302.

\_\_\_\_\_. *The Infinite Bonds of Family: Domesticity in Canada, 1850-1940*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999.

Corbiere Lavell, J. and D. Lavell-Harvard, eds. *"Until Our Hearts are On the Ground":*

- Aboriginal Mothering, Oppression, Resistance and Rebirth*. Toronto: Demeter Press, 2006.
- Cuthbert Brandt, G. "Canadian National Histories: Their Evolving Content and Uses," *The History Teacher* 30.2 (Feb. 1997): 137-44.
- Dumont, M., M. Jean, M. Lavigne, J. Stoddart (Le Clio Collectif). *L'histoire des femmes au Québec depuis quatre siècles*. Montreal: Quinze, 1982.
- Fildes, V., L. Marks and H. Marland, eds. *Women and Children First: International Maternal and Infant Welfare, 1870-1945*. London: Routledge, 1992.
- Fleming, R.B. "The Unbearable Lightness of Being Canadian," *Journal of Canadian Studies/Revue d'études canadiennes* 27 (Été 1992 Summer): 131-35.
- Fournier, S. and E. Crey. *Stolen from Our Embrace: The Abduction of First Nations Children and the Restoration of Aboriginal Communities*. Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1997.
- Francis, D. *National Dreams: Myth, Memory and Canadian History*. Vancouver: Arsenal Pulp Press, 1997.
- Gagnon, M. *Les femmes vue par le Québec des hommes, 30 ans d'histoire des idéologies, 1940-1970*. Montréal: Éditions du Jour, 1974.
- Gleason, M. *Normalizing the Ideal: Psychology, Schooling and the Family in Postwar Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999.
- Gorham, D. "Flora MacDonald Denison: A Canadian Feminist," *A Not Unreasonable Claim: Women and Reform in Canada, 1880s-1920s*. Toronto: The Women's Press, 1979.
- Gosselin, Cheryl. "Maternal Commitments to the Nation: Maternalist Groups at Work in Quebec: 1945-1960," *Journal of the Association for Research on Mothering* 8.1,2 (2006): 282-97.
- Granatstein, J. *Who Killed Canadian History?* Toronto: HarperCollins Publishers, 1998.
- Iacovetta, F. "The Sexual Politics of Moral Citizenship and Containing 'Dangerous' Foreign Men in Cold War Canada, 1950s-1960s," *Histoire sociale/Social History* 33.66 (2000): 361-89.
- Kealey, G. "Class in English-Canadian Historical Writing: Neither Privatizing, Nor Sundering," *Journal of Canadian Studies/Revue d'études canadiennes* 27 (Été 1992 Summer): 123-29.
- Kealey, L., ed. *A Not Unreasonable Claim: Women and Reform in Canada, 1880s-1920s*. Toronto: The Women's Press, 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_, R. Roach Pierson, J. Sangster and V. Strong-Boag. "Teaching Canadian History in the 1990s: Whose 'National' History are We Lamenting?" *Journal of Canadian Studies/Revue d'études canadiennes* 27 (Été 1992 Summer): 129-31.
- Korinek, V. *Roughing It In the Suburbs: Reading Chatelaine Magazine in the Fifties and Sixties*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000.
- Koven, S. and S. Michel, eds. *Mothers of a New World: Maternalist Politics and the Origins of Welfare States*. London: Routledge, 1993.
- Ladd-Taylor, M. *Raising a Baby the Government Way: Mother's Letters to the Children's Bureau, 1915-1932*. New Brunswick: Rutgers, 1986.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Mother-Work: Women, Child Welfare, and the State, 1890-1930*. Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1994.
- Lemieux, D. and L. Mercier. *Les femmes au tournant du siècle, 1880-1940: âges de la vie, maternité et quotidien*. Québec: Institut québécois de recherche sur la culture, 1989.
- Lévesque, A. *La norme et les deviantes : des femmes au Québec pendant*

- l'entre-deux-guerres*. Montréal: Éditions du Remue-ménage, 1989.
- Lindström, V. *Defiant Sisters: A Social History of Finnish Immigrant Women in Canada*. 1992.
- Little, M. *No Car, No Radio, No Liquor Permit: The Moral Regulation of Single Mothers in Ontario, 1920-1997*. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- Mann, S. "Les femmes dans l'oeuvre de Groulx." *Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française* 32.3 (décembre 1978): 385-98.
- \_\_\_\_\_ and A. Prentice, eds., *The Neglected Majority: Essays in Canadian Women's History*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1977.
- Maynard, S. "The Maple Leaf (Gardens) Forever: Sex, Canadian Historians and National History," *Journal of Canadian Studies* 36.2 (Été 2001 Summer): 70-105.
- McKillop, A. "Who Killed Canadian History? A View from the Trenches," *Canadian Historical Review* 80.2 (1999): 269-99.
- McLaren, A. *Our Own Master Race: Eugenics in Canada, 1885-1945*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1990.
- \_\_\_\_\_ and A. McLaren. *The Bedroom and the State: The Changing Practices and Politics of Contraception and Abortion in Canada, 1880-1980*. Toronto: McLelland and Stewart, 1986.
- Mitchinson, W. *The Nature of Their Bodies: Women and Their Doctors in Victorian Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Giving Birth in Canada, 1900-1950*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2002.
- Palmer, B. "Of Silences and Trenches: A Dissident View of Granatstein's Meaning," *Canadian Historical Review* 80.4 (December 1999): 676-86.
- Perry, A. *On the Edge of Empire: Gender, Race, and the Making of British Columbia, 1849-1871*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000.
- Roach Pierson, R., A. Lévesque and K. Arnup, eds. *Delivering Motherhood: Maternal Ideologies and Practices in the 19th and 20th Centuries*. New York: Routledge, 1990.
- Rutherford, M. *Women and the White Man's God: Gender and Race in the Canadian Mission Field*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2002.
- Sheck, R. *Mothers of the Nation: Right-Wing Women in Weimar Germany*. Oxford: Berg, 2004.
- Smith, A. *Conquest: Sexual Violence and American Indian Genocide*. Cambridge: South End Press, 2005.
- Stanley, T. "Why I Killed Canadian History: Conditions for an Anti-Racist History in Canada," *Histoire sociale/Social History* 33.65 (2000): 79-103.
- Strong-Boag, V. *The New Day Recalled: Lives of Girls and Women in English Canada, 1919-1930*. Toronto: Copp Clark Pitman Ltd., 1988.
- Swyripa, F. *Wedded to the Cause: Ukrainian-Canadian Women and Ethnic Identity, 1891-1991*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1993.
- Trevithick, S. "Native Residential Schooling in Canada: A Review of the Literature," *Canadian Journal of Native Studies* 18.1 (1998): 5-52.
- Vacante, J. "Writing the History of Sexuality and 'National' History in Quebec," *Journal of Canadian Studies* 39.2 (Printemps 2005 Spring): 31-55.
- Van Kirk, S. *Many Tender Ties: Women in Fur-Trade Society, 1670-1870*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1983.